# **Administrative Procedure: Program Discontinuance**

**AP 4021** 

Reference: Education Code 78016; Title 5, 51022, 55130

# PROGRAM REVITALIZATION, SUSPENSION, AND/OR DISCONTINUANCE ADMINISTRATIVE PROCEDURE 1

### **Background**

In accordance with title 5, Section 51022, "college districts are required by regulation and statute to develop a process for program discontinuance and minimum criteria for the discontinuance of occupational programs."

The Academic Senate for California Community Colleges (ASCCC) has recommended that local senates in consultation with the collective bargaining agent develop a process for program discontinuance that takes into account the following issues:

- impact on student learning, goals, and needs;
- affect on the balance of the college curriculum;
- impact on educational and budget planning; and
- changes in regional economic and training conditions.

### **Policy Statement**

The Academic Senate of Cuesta College has updated the campus Program Discontinuance Policy in accordance with Title 5, section 51022, and in consideration of the recommendations and guidelines of the Academic Senate for California Community Colleges (ASCCC). The primary purpose of this policy is to establish criteria and guidelines for decisions regarding the revitalization, suspension, and/or discontinuance of programs proposed for such action. Following due process and using appropriate data, this policy will ensure that all programs under consideration for suspension or discontinuance must be proposed for such consideration using the policy guidelines as stated herein.

### **Program Definition**

An *instructional program* is defined as a discipline and as an organized sequence or grouping of courses leading to a defined objective such as a major, degree, certificate, license, the acquisition of selected knowledge or skills, or transfer to another institution of higher education.

### **Policy Summary**

When a program's effectiveness is in question due to the content of a Institutional Program Plan and Review (IPPR) Template and has demonstrated to be in need of further review for possible revitalization, suspension, or discontinuance based on a number of factors, this policy provides the process and procedure for such programs to be considered for revitalization, suspension, and/or discontinuance as defined later in this policy.

### There are five stages to the Program Revitalization, Suspension, and/or Discontinuance Process:

- Stage One: Proposal Request (Appendix A)
  - o A Proposal Request for Program Revitalization, Suspension, and/or Discontinuance must be informed by the content of an Institutional Program Plan and Review (IPPR) Template.
  - Any full-time faculty member in the program, division chair, dean, or the VP of Academic
     Affairs may prepare a Proposal Request form and present it to the College Council for their
     approval to initiate the Program Revitalization, Suspension, and/or Discontinuance Process.
  - Multiple indicators must be checked on the Proposal Request form for the proposal to be consider valid by the College Council.

Approved by the Academic Senate Council on 4-23-10 after incorporating final feedback from the Shared Governance Council on 4-13-10.

- Each Proposal Request form must be signed by one of each of the following three personnel: one program faculty member, the division chair of record, and the dean of record or the VP of Academic Affairs.
- Each signed Proposal Request must be presented as an agenda item to the College Council for consideration.

### • Stage Two: Review of Proposal Request—College Council

- If a Proposal Request is approved by the College Council, a Task Force is assigned by the Council to convene work on a recommendation report for the program to either be continued, revitalized, suspended, or discontinued.
- If a Proposal Request is denied by the College Council, the meeting minutes must reflect the reasons for the denial of the Request.

### Stage Three: Program Analysis Forms (Appendices B & C)

- If the proposal request is approved by the College Council, the program's dean, division chair, lead faculty member or coordinator, and the Office of Institutional Research will complete a Program Analysis Form within two weeks.
- This Program Analysis Forms are a report on current and past quantitative and qualitative data on the program that must be researched and reported so that the Task Force can make an informed recommendation to the College Council regarding the program's continuance, revitalization, suspension, or discontinuance.
- The completed Program Analysis Forms will be submitted to the co-chairs of the Task Force, who will then begin work analyzing the data provided.

### • Stage Four: Task Force Program Recommendation Report

The Task Force will evaluate the Program Analysis Forms and present a recommendation report to the College Council for consideration regarding the continuance, revitalization, suspension, or discontinuance of the program.

### • Stage Five: Decision—College Council

- The College Council will evaluate the Task Force Program Recommendation Report and make a decision to continue, revitalize, suspend, or discontinue a program based on the recommendations of the Task Force.
- The President/Superintendent has full responsibility and authority to implement the decision of the College Council.

### 1. CRITERIA AND GUIDELINES FOR THE DECISION-MAKING PROCESS

### A. Initiation of the Process

- (1) A Proposal Request for Program Revitalization, Suspension, and/or Discontinuance must be informed by the content of a Institutional Program Plan & Review (IPPR) Template.
- (2) A program may be recommended for program revitalization, suspension, and/or discontinuance with the Proposal Request Form (Appendix A) by a full-time faculty member or division chair within the program, by the Dean supervising the program, and/or by the Vice President of Academic Affairs.
- (3) The Proposal Request Form for program revitalization, suspension, and/or discontinuance must be proposed to the College Council with multiple indicators, which may include but are not limited to following:
  - Weak enrollment trend
  - Insufficient frequency of course section offerings to assure reasonable availability for students to complete the program within its stated duration
  - Poor retention within courses

- Poor term-to-term persistence for those students in courses in the major
- Changes in the job market, community/student needs or interests, transfer requirements
- Diminished outside funding resources
- Program creates financial hardship for the institution
- Lack of available qualified program personnel
- Outdated curriculum
- Outdated equipment; and/or
- Outdated facilities.
- (4) The Proposal Request Form must be presented on a College Council agenda for approval. If the College Council approves the proposal, a Task Force will be convened to analyze all pertinent information and make a recommendation. In addition, the program's dean, division chair, lead faculty member or coordinator, and the Office of Institutional Research will complete the Program Analysis Forms (Appendices B & C) within two weeks of College Council approval of the Proposal Request Form and submit this to the co-chairs of the program revitalization, suspension, and/or discontinuance Task Force appointed by the College Council.

### B. Program Revitalization, Suspension, and/or Discontinuance Task Force

- (1) The Task Force shall be composed of the following:
  - Dean of the program (Co-Chair, with faculty member as described below)
  - Division chair or designee\*of the program
  - 1 faculty member who teaches in the program
  - Academic Senate President or designee
  - Chair of the Curriculum Committee or designee
  - CCFT President or designee
  - 1 representative of the College Council

\*If the program has a academic director, the director will also serve.

- (2) The Task Force will be co-chaired by a faculty member to be selected from and by the membership of the Task Force. The responsibilities of the co-chairs of the Task Force include, but are not be limited to, the following:
  - Consultation with the Office of Institutional Research and other resources to validate information being used in determining recommendations.
  - Maintenance of objectivity and integrity during the entire process.
  - Meeting minutes recorded for each meeting.
  - The production of a Task Force Recommendation Report (Appendix D) within 90 days of the formation of the Task Force that will specify the outcome of its research and deliberations and make specific recommendations for action, complete with timelines.
- (3) The Task Force Recommendation Report must include the following:
  - A recommendation for the program's continuance, revitalization, suspension, or discontinuance;
  - A summary of the reasons for the recommendation;
  - A summary of the process used by the Task Force:
  - A review of the Program Analysis Forms (Appendices B & C) and all data consulted; and
  - A detailed assessment of the recommendations' impact on the college's overall educational program and budget, as well as its impact on all students, faculty, and staff involved.

- C. <u>Possible Recommendations provided by the Task Force Recommendation Report</u> (Appendix D)
  - (1) Program Continuance A program may be recommended to continue without any qualifications or recommendations.
  - (2) Program Revitalization A program may be recommended to continue with qualifications. These may include, but are not limited to, specific interventions designed to improve the viability and responsiveness of the program. Examples of Program Revitalization may include:
    - A plan of action to enhance the performance and effectiveness of an existing program, discipline or department, which could include establishing training/professional development for faculty and or curriculum changes/updates.
    - A recommendation to restructure an existing program, discipline or department for greater effectiveness, including restructuring or joining of smaller departments into a larger one, or splitting the program into larger departments.
    - A recommendation to develop a new program from the existing program.

The Task Force Recommendation Report for Program Revitalization shall include a timeline during which these interventions will occur and expected outcomes will be outlined. All interventions and timelines will also be communicated in writing to the division chair, Dean of the program and Vice-President of Academic Affairs. After the specified revitalization period is completed, the program will be reviewed again on a regular program review cycle with a completed Comprehensive Program Plan and Review (CPPR).

- (3) Program Suspension A program may be recommended for a one to three year temporary suspension. Any recommendation for program suspension must include the criteria used to arrive at the recommendation. Examples or reasoning for the temporary suspension may include but are not limited to:
  - safety issues,
  - equipment purchase update,
  - · unqualified faculty,
  - regulatory suspension, and/or
  - lack of funding resources.

The Task Force Recommendation Report for Program Suspension shall consider and/or include the following: A detailed plan and recommended timeline for the suspension of the program with the least impact on students, faculty, staff and the community.

- An impact report explaining how phasing out the program for suspension will affect students, faculty, staff, and the community based on the Program Analysis data (Appendices B & C).
- The amount of cost savings achieved by virtue of the program's discontinuance.
- Recommendations for how currently enrolled students may continue their program of study or a plan for students to meet their educational objectives through alternative means while the program is under suspension.

- The requirements of collective bargaining for faculty and staff, including application of
  policies for reduction in force and opportunities for retraining of faculty and staff, if
  necessary, while the program is under suspension.
- (4) Program Discontinuance A recommendation to discontinue a program, discipline or department will occur when, after a full evaluation study, it is concluded that it is no longer in the best interest of the college, its students, and the larger community for the program to continue. Any recommendation for program discontinuance must include the criteria used to arrive at the recommendation.

The Task Force Recommendation Report for Program Discontinuance shall consider and/or include the following:

A detailed plan and recommended timeline for phasing out the program for discontinuance with the least impact on students, faculty, staff and the community.

- An impact report explaining how phasing out the program for discontinuance will affect students, faculty, staff, and the community based on the Program Analysis data (Appendices B & C).
- The amount of cost savings achieved by virtue of the program's discontinuance.
- Recommendations for how currently enrolled students may continue their program of study or a plan for students to meet their educational objectives through alternative means.
- The requirements of collective bargaining for faculty and staff, including application of policies for reduction in force and opportunities for retraining of faculty and staff.

### D. <u>Decision-Making Process and Implementation of Task Force Recommendation Report</u>

- (1) The Task Force will present the Recommendation Report for Program Revitalization, Suspension and/or Discontinuance to the College Council for comment and approval. If the Recommendation Report is approved by the College Council, the President/Superintendent has full responsibility and authority to implement this decision as designee of the Board of Trustees.
- (2) If the President/Superintendent decides to implement the approved Recommendation Report for Program Revitalization, Suspension and/or Discontinuance, the affected Vice President(s), Dean, Division Chair, and faculty and staff will develop the actual program revitalization, suspension and/or discontinuance timeline, taking into consideration the following:
  - Faculty reassignment by FSA or termination
  - Staff reassignment or termination
  - Alternatives for students to complete program degree(s) and/or certificates.
  - Redistribution/discontinuance of equipment, supplies, facilities, and budget.
- (3) If the President/Superintendent decides not to implement the approved Recommendation Report for Program Revitalization, Suspension, and/or Discontinuance, then he or she shall communicate the reasons in writing to the College Council.
- (4) The President/Superintendent shall report the final decision regarding the Program Revitalization, Suspension, and/or Discontinuance to the Board of Trustees with the reasons for the recommendation.

If the final decision is to suspend or discontinue the program, then the Vice President of Academic Affairs or Vice-President of Student Services, Academic Senate, CCFT, CCCUE, appropriate dean(s), division chair(s), academic directors, and/or program instructor(s) will participate in the following steps:

- (5) Consult with affected faculty and staff member(s) regarding their employment rights.
- (6) Consult with students regarding their options for program completion or transfer.

Approved: July 7, 2010

Effective Date: July 7, 2010

# **Appendix A**

### PROPOSAL REQUEST FORM

### Request to Initiate a Program Revitalization, Suspension, and/or Discontinuance Process

The following program may be a candidate for Program Revitalization, Suspension, and/or Discontinuance:

Program Name:		

- This Proposal Request must be supported by the findings reported in the program's Institutional Program Plan and Review (IPPR) Template.
- This Proposal Request shall be presented on a College Council meeting agenda, and the Council
  will determine if a Task Force should be convened to evaluate the program for continuance,
  revitalization, suspension, or discontinuance.
- If the Proposal Request is approved by the College Council, the program dean, division chair, lead
  faculty or coordinator, and the Director of Institutional Research will complete the two Program
  Analysis Forms (Appendices B & C) within a two-week period and submit to the Vice-President of
  Academic Affairs.
- The Task Force will be composed of the discipline dean, division chair, program coordinator or academic director (if applicable), discipline faculty, Academic Senate President or designee, Curriculum Committee Chair or designee, CCFT President or designee, and one member of the College Council. The Office of Institutional Research will also participate to complete the Task Force Recommendation Report.

Please check the multiple indicators that provoke the initiation of a Program Revitalization, Suspension and/or Discontinuance Process. Please attach the program's most recent Annual Program Planning Worksheet (APPW) and Comprehensive Program Planning & Review (CPPR) to this proposal request.

	MULTIPLE INDICATORS (places shock multiple indicators below and be prepared to explain								
V	MULTIPLE INDICATORS (please check multiple indicators below and be prepared to explain each)								
	Weak enrollment trend								
	Insufficient availability of courses for students to complete the program within its stated duration								
	Poor retention within courses								
	or term-to-term persistence for those students in courses in the major								
	nges in the job market								
	Changes in community/student needs or interests								
	Change in transfer requirements								
	Diminished outside funding resources								
	Program creates financial hardship for the institution								
	Lack of available qualified program personnel								
	Outdated curriculum								
	Outdated equipment								
	Outdated facilities								
	Other:								
Divi	sion Curriculum Representative or Discipline faculty  Date								
ועוט	Sion Curriculum Nepresentative or Discipline faculty Date								
Div.	sion Chair or Academic Director (if applicable)  Date								
ועוט	sion Chair or Academic Director (if applicable)  Date								
Dea	an or Vice President of Academic Affairs Date								

# Appendix B

# PROGRAM ANALYSIS FORM – QUANTITATIVE DATA

### PROGRAM REVITALIZATION, SUSPENSION AND/OR DISCONTINUANCE

The report will address all applicable criteria below unless information is unavailable or not applicable.

Quantitative Indicators											
	Fall 2005	Spring 2006	Fall 2006	Spring 2007	Fall 2007	Spring 2008	Fall 2008	Spring 2009	Fall 2009		
Total student enrollment											
Number of class sections											
3. Fill rates/caps											
4. FTES											
5. WSCH/FTEF											
6. FTES/FTEF											
7. Term-to term persistence of students in the program.											
8. Retention											
Student Success (C or better).											
<ol> <li>Number of graduated/certified students from the program.</li> </ol>											

# **Appendix C**

### PROGRAM ANALYSIS FORM - QUALITATIVE DATA

### PROGRAM REVITALIZATION, SUSPENSION AND/OR DISCONTINUANCE

This report will address all applicable criteria below unless information is unavailable or not applicable.

### **Qualitative Indicators**

- 1. The Discipline's pedagogical methods, analyses, and techniques currently used appropriate and updated compare to three successful programs outside the institution?
- 2. The impact the action will have on the general education curriculum or the curriculum of other programs.
- 3. The effect on students as a result of the discontinuance of the program.
- 4. The college's ability or inability to provide the resources to maintain the program.
- 5. Evidence supporting declining demand for service or skills.
- 6. A copy of the program review and recommendations.
- 7. The potential impact on diversity at Cuesta College.
- 8. The ability of students to complete their degree or certificate or to transfer. This includes maintaining the catalog rights of students.
- 9. Effects on local business and industries- i.e., declining market/industry demand (local, regional).
- 10. Availability of the program at other community colleges.
- 11. If this is a grant-funded program, what was the agreed institutional commitment for the campus to continue this program?
- 12. List specific financial resources required to sustain the program:
  - Faculty compensation FT/PT
  - Support Staff compensation
  - o Facilities costs annualized
  - Equipment costs annualized
  - Supplies cost annualized

# Appendix D

# GUIDELINES: THE TASK FORCE RECOMMENDATION REPORT FOR PROGRAM REVITALIZATION, SUSPENSION AND/OR DISCONTINUANCE

### **Composition of Task Force**

The Task Force shall be composed of the following:

- Dean of the program (Co-Chair, with faculty member as described below)
- Division chair of program or designee\*
- 1 faculty member who teaches in the program
- Academic Senate President or designee
- Chair of the Curriculum Committee or designee
- CCFT President or designee
- 1 representative of the College Council

The Task Force will be co-chaired by a faculty member to be selected from and by the membership of the Task Force.

Duties of the Task Force Co-Chairs should include but not be limited to:

- Ensuring the Task Force consults with the Office of Institutional Research and other personnel and/or resources to validate information being used in determining recommendations.
- Maintaining objectivity and integrity in the process.
- Ensuring minutes are recorded for each meeting.

Within 90 days of the formation of the Task Force, it will produce a Task Force Recommendation Report specifying the outcome of its research with specific recommendations for action, complete with timelines. This Recommendation Report must include the following:

- The name of the program
- A recommendation for the program's continuance, revitalization, suspension, or discontinuance
- A summary of the reasons for the recommendation
- A summary of the process used by the Task Force.
- A review of the Program Analysis Form and all data consulted.
- A detailed assessment of the impact of this recommendation on the college's overall budget and educational program, as well as its impact on all students, faculty, and staff involved.

### Possible Recommendations of the Task Force Recommendation Report

- 1. **Program Continuance** A program may be recommended to continue without any qualifications or recommendations.
- **2. Program Revitalization** A program may be recommended to continue with qualifications. These may include, but are not limited to, specific interventions designed to improve the viability and responsiveness of the program. Examples of Program Revitalization may include:
  - A plan of action to enhance the performance and effectiveness of an existing program, discipline or department, which could include establishing training/professional development for faculty and or curriculum changes/updates.

<sup>\*</sup>If program has a director, the director will also serve.

# **Appendix D (cont.)**

- A recommendation to restructure an existing program, discipline or department for greater effectiveness, including restructuring or joining of smaller departments into a larger one, or splitting the program into larger departments.
- A recommendation to develop a new program from the existing program.

The Task Force Recommendation Report for Program Revitalization shall include a timeline during which these interventions will occur and expected outcomes will be outlined. All interventions and timelines will also be communicated in writing to the division chair, Dean of the program and Vice-President of Academic Affairs. After the specified revitalization period is completed, the program will be reviewed again on a regular program review cycle with a completed Comprehensive Program Plan and Review (CPPR).

**3. Program Suspension** – A program may be recommended for a one to three year temporary suspension.

Any recommendation for program suspension must include the criteria used to arrive at the recommendation. Examples or reasoning for the temporary suspension may include but are not limited to:

- safety issues,
- · equipment purchase update,
- unqualified faculty,
- regulatory suspension, and/or
- lack of funding resources.

The Task Force Recommendation Report for Program Suspension shall consider and/or include the following:

- A detailed plan and recommended timeline for the suspension of the program with the least impact on students, faculty, staff and the community.
- An impact report explaining how phasing out the program for suspension will affect students, faculty, staff, and the community based on the Program Analysis data (Appendices B & C).
- The amount of cost savings achieved by virtue of the program's discontinuance.
- Recommendations for how currently enrolled students may continue their program of study or a plan for students to meet their educational objectives through alternative means while the program is under suspension.
- The requirements of collective bargaining for faculty and staff, including application of
  policies for reduction in force and opportunities for retraining of faculty and staff, if
  necessary, while the program is under suspension.
- 4. Program Discontinuance A recommendation to discontinue a program, discipline or department will occur when, after a full evaluation study, it is concluded that it is no longer in the best interest of the college, its students, and the larger community for the program to continue. Any recommendation for program discontinuance must include the criteria used to arrive at the recommendation.

The Task Force Recommendation Report for Program Discontinuance shall consider and/or include the following:

- A detailed plan and recommended timeline for phasing out the program for discontinuance with the least impact on students, faculty, staff and the community.
- An impact report explaining how phasing out the program for discontinuance will affect students, faculty, staff, and the community based on the Program Analysis data (Appendices B & C).

# Appendix D (cont.)

- The amount of cost savings achieved by virtue of the program's discontinuance.
- Recommendations for how currently enrolled students may continue their program of study or a plan for students to meet their educational objectives through alternative means.
- The requirements of collective bargaining for faculty and staff, including application of policies for reduction in force and opportunities for retraining of faculty and staff.

#### **Evidence**

The Task Force Recommendation Report must be based on a broad and thorough investigation of factors relating to the benefits of a program for students, for the college, and for the community served by Cuesta College. The Task Force shall gather and evaluate the appropriate evidence as they formulate their recommendations, and this evidence shall include, but is not limited to, the following:

- Program Analysis Forms (Appendices B & C)
- Relation of the program to the College Mission, Vision, and Values Statements
- Relation of the program to the Strategic Plan
- Relation of the program to the Educational and Facilities Master Plan
- Outside expert opinion from professional publications, organizations, and/or other institutions
- Projected impact on overall educational program, students, faculty, college budget and community

The Task Force process for gathering information may include interviews with faculty, staff and students involved in the affected area and in related instructional areas. Outside experts, faculty and/or administrators from other institutions may be consulted. In addition, the Task Force shall consult when necessary with District, regional, and State agencies and institutions overseeing specific types of programs, such as certain vocational programs.

### **Decision**

- 1. The Task Force will present the Recommendation Report for Program Revitalization, Suspension and/or Discontinuance to the College Council for comment and approval. If the Recommendation Report is approved by the College Council, the President/Superintendent has full responsibility and authority to implement this decision as designee of the Board of Trustees.
- 2. If the President/Superintendent decides to implement the approved Recommendation Report for Program Revitalization, Suspension and/or Discontinuance, the affected Vice President(s), Dean, Division Chair, and faculty and staff will develop the actual program revitalization, suspension and/or discontinuance timeline, taking into consideration the following:
  - Faculty FSA's reassignment or termination
  - Staff reassignment or termination
  - Alternatives for students to complete program degree(s) and/or certificates.
  - Redistribution/discontinuance of equipment, supplies, facilities, and budget.
- 3. If the President/Superintendent decides not to implement the approved Recommendation Report for Program Revitalization, Suspension, and/or Discontinuance, then he or she shall communicate the reasons in writing to the College Council.
- **4.** The President/Superintendent shall report the final decision regarding the program's revitalization, suspension, and/or discontinuance to the Board of Trustees with the reasons for the recommendation.